DOCUMENT RESUME

ED 109 922 FL 007 021

AUTHOR Aitken, Kenneth G., Comp.
TITLE TESL Applications of the Cloze Procedure: An Annotated Bibliography.
PUB DATE 28 Mar 75
NOTE 16p.

EDRS PRICE MF-$0.76 HC-$1.58 PLUS POSTAGE
DESCRIPTORS *Annotated Bibliographies; *Cloze Procedure; *English (Second Language); *Language Tests; *Reading Comprehension; Reading Tests; Test Construction; Testing; Test Interpretation; Test Selection

ABSTRACT

This bibliography is intended to provide a selective list of references on the cloze procedure and its application to teaching English as a second language. Part one of the bibliography includes seven general references on the cloze procedure in general, i.e., research reviews and bibliographies. These were chosen because they provide extensive bibliographies. Part two contains thirty-one annotated items, which treat specific problems in the application of the cloze procedure to ESL. Items are mostly MA and Ph.D. theses and published journal articles. (Author/AM)

****
* Documents acquired by ERIC include many informal unpublished *
* materials not available from other sources. ERIC makes every effort *
* to obtain the best copy available. nevertheless, items of marginal *
* reproducibility are often encountered and this affects the quality *
* of the microfiche and hardcopy reproductions ERIC makes available *
* via the ERIC Document Reproduction Service (EDRS). EDRS is not *
* responsible for the quality of the original document. Reproductions *
* supplied by EDRS are the best that can be made from the original. *
****

ED109922

TESL Applications

of the

Cloze Procedure

An Annotated Bibliography

Compiled

by

Kenneth C. Aitken

English Language Training Department

Vancouver Community College

March 28, 1975

FL007021

TESL Applications of the Cloze Procedure: An Annotated Bibliography

INTRODUCTION

Since Wilson Taylor first published his paper on cloze procedure in 1953, a considerable body of research on this technique has been undertaken. However, most of this research has been done on English as a native language.

The cloze procedure is a method of systematically deleting words from a prose passage and then evaluating the success the subject has in predicting the deleted words. Various deletion methods and scoring procedures have been studied.

Though early work on cloze centred on the test construction methodology, later researchers investigated the use of cloze in measuring comprehension, readability, and overall language proficiency.

The purpose of this bibliography is to provide a reference on the cloze procedure and its application to English as a second language (ESL).

The bibliography is divided into two parts: the first includes general references, the second contains an annotated bibliography.

No attempt has been made to include every article dealing with the cloze procedure in ESL, or in foreign language studies in general. Several bibliographies have been included to assist those who might be interested in the larger body of material relating to cloze procedure in English as a native language.

PART A General References

This section contains several reviews of research, and Robinson's bibliography. The article by Klare et al (1972) is included here because contains a very large bibliography, as well as sample tests and instructions for students. In recognition of its effect and influence

on later work, Wilson Taylor's original articles has also been listed here.

1. Bickley, A.C., Billie J. Ellington, and Rachel T. Bickley. "The Cloze Procedure: A Conspectus", Journal of Reading Behavior, vol. 2 (Summer 1970), pp. 232-249.

The arthors review 105 studies concerned with various aspects of cloze.

2. Johasma, Eugene. The Cloze Procedure: A Survey of Research. Bloomington, Indiana: Indiana University School of Education (Occasional Papers in Reading), 1971.

Jongsma reviews 69 papers related to research in cloze as a measurement device in reading.

3. Johnsma, Eugene. The Cloze Procedure As A Teaching Technique. Newark Delaware: The International Reading Association, 1971.

In this publication Jongsma reviews ten studies on applications of cloze procedure as a teaching rather than a testing technique.

4. Klare, G.R., W.W. Sinaiko, and L.M. Stolurow. "The cloze procedure: a convenient readability test for training materials and translations". International Review of Applied Psychology, vol. 21, no. 2 (1972), pp. 77-106.

Contains an extensive bibliography of cloze research.

5. Potter, Thomas C. A Taxonomy of Cloze Research Part 1: Readability and Reading Comprehension. Inglewood, Calif: Southwest Regional Laboratory for Educational Research and Development, 1968. ED 035 514

6. Robinson, Richard D. An Introduction to the Cloze Procedure. Newark, Delaware: International Reading Association, 1972.

Robinson's annotated bibliography contains 34 references on cloze procedure that provide a helpful introduction to what has been done and where it can be found.

7. Taylor, Wilson. "Cloze Procedure: A New Tool for Measuring Readability", Journalism Quarterly, vol. 30 (Fall 1953), pp. 415-433.

Taylor introduces the term cloze procedure and defines it. He suggests a number of applications of the technique and reports on a number of pilot studies concerning the construction of cloze tests and how they can be used to determine readability. This is the article that has sparked the wide interest in the cloze technique.

PART B Applications of Cloze Procedure to ESL

In this section 31 items are listed alphabetically by author. Each listing is followed by an explanatory notation of its contents.

1. Aitken, Kenneth G.

Problems in cloze testing re-examined. TESL Reporter, vol. 8, no. 2 (Winter 1974).

Three issues pertinent to the cons truction and application of cloze tests, presented in R.K. Williams', Problems in cloze testing, TESL Reporter, vol. 7, no. 4 (Summer 1974), are examined in light of empirical data, and current theory in psycholinguistics. It is argued that cloze tests parallel the reading process. Furthermore, there is no special talent involved in successfully completing a cloze test. Finally it is argued that there is no advantage gained in using other than an every n-th word deletion system.

2. Anderson, Jonathan.

The application of cloze procedure to English learned as a foreign language in Papua and New Guinea. English Language Teaching, vol. 27, no. 1 (October 1972), pp. 66-72.

This article explores the use of cloze procedure as a measure of readability and the reading comprehension of passages of English by readers of English as a foreign language. Results indicate that the cloze procedure ranked the passages in the same way as the criterion of reading difficulty. The cloze also discriminated between

subjects' reading ability. Four different scoring procedure showed almost perfect agreement in ordering subjects over the cloze tests. The author's conclusions are drawn from studies using a limited number of subjects, at a relatively low level of EFL.

3. Anderson, Jonathan.

A technique for measuring reading comprehension and readability. English Language Teaching, vol. 25, no. 2 (1971), pp. 178-182.

The article justifies cloze procedure as a measure of reading comprehension and readability. Cloze test construction is described. Blank-filling and sentence completion tests are not the same as a cloze test. The use of cloze procedure with ESL students is discussed.

4. Anderson, Jonathan.

Selecting a suitable "reader": procedure for teachers to assess language difficulty. R.E.L.C. Journal, vol. 2 (December 1971), pp. 35-42.

This article complements one by R.J. Owen entitled "Selecting a suitable 'reader'" in the same issue as this article. Anderson describes the cloze procedure as a measure of reading difficulty. Anderson discusses cloze test construction, scoring by the exact-word method and other methods, and interpreting the cloze test scores into levels of reading based on cloze test percentage scores.

5. Bowen, J. Donald.

"Lecturettes" for mature learners. English Teaching Forum, vol. 12, no. 1 (January-March 1974), pp. 8-15.

Bowen describes a modified comprehension and dictation technique requiring integrative skills in a structured series of activities of increasing demand on the student. As the student listens to a short taped "lecturette" he completes an cloze-format exercise based on the tape script.

6. Cohan, Andrew D.

An Up-Date Report on the English Language Placement Exam. Workpapers in Teaching English as a Second Language, vol. 7 (1973), pp. 101-106.

This paper discuss es the development of an electic approach to ESL placement testing using both integrative and discrete point tests with special problems built in to distinguish between minority-English dialects and ESL speakers.

7. Crawford, A.N.

   The Cloze Procedure as a Measure of the Reading Comprehension of Elementary Level Maxican-American and Anglo-American Children. Unpublished doctoral dissertation, University of California, Los Angeles, 1970. Dissertation Abstracts, vol. 31 (1971), pp. 3162A #71-1813.

The purpose of this study was to investigate the validity reliability and appropriateness of cloze tests as a measure of reading comprehension of third and sixth grade Mexican-American and Anglo-American children. Four basic problems were examined: (1). the correlation between cloze scores and standardized reading tests and oral reading tests; (2). the differences between cloze scores for each group at the different levels: (3). the reliability coefficients of cloze scores for groups at each level: and (4). the degree of correspondence between instructional reading levels as determined by cloze tests, and by standardized reading tests, oral reading tests and teacher's judgement for groups on each level. The 180 subjects, half from each grade, were composed of equal numbers of Mexican-Americans with Spanish dominant and Anglo-Americans with English dominant. It was concluded that cloze tests are a valid and reliable means of testing reading comprehension and determining instructional reading levels for both groups at both levels.

8. Darnell, Donald K.

   Clozentropy: a procedure for testing English language proficiency for foreign students. Speech Monographs, vol. 37, no. 1 (March 1970), pp. 36-46.

Describes a study of the effectiveness of clozentropy which combines a variation of cloze procedure with an "entropy" measure for indexing the compatibility of one's responses with those of a criterion group.

The clozentropy test taken by 48 foreign students who also took the Test of English as a Foreign Language (TOEFL), was given to 200 native speakers. For the foreign students who took both tests the total test scores correlated at .833. Strengths and weaknesses are discussed. See also: Darnell, Donald K., "The development of an English language proficiency test of foreign students using a clozentropy procedure. Final Report." ERIC ED 024 039

9. Dien, Ton That.

A Measure of Language Competence Using the Cloze Procedure. Unpublished M.A. thesis, U.C.L.A. 1971.

This thesis investigates three questions relating to the applicability of the cloze procedure as a measure of language competence: (1) Is there any significant difference in the results of cloze tests on an original text and that of a translation? (2) How well does the cloze procedure distinguish between a groups competence in their native and a foreign language? (3) Can cloze tests reveal problems of foreign language learners?

10. Friedman, Mildred M.

The Use of Cloze Procedure for Improving the Reading Comprehension of Foreign Students at the University of Florida. Doctoral dissertation, University of Florida, 1964. Dissertation Abstracts, vol. 25 (4-6), pp. 3420-3421, #64-11,533.

The purpose of this study was to determine if by using the cloze procedure simple reading material could be made interesting enough for mature students. Three foreign-student English classes at the University of Florida were used. Two classes did 20 cloze exercises made from McCall Crabb's Standard Test Lessons in Reading, Books A to E (Grades 3 to 7). The other class had the same readings undeleted. All groups were given a multiple-choice test after each reading. All students took the Metropolitan Achievement Test, Reading Section, Intermediate Level and a vocabulary-in-context test based on the MAT vocabulary subtest. Cloze tests were found to be valid as measures of reading comprehension for foreign students.

A complete knowledge of vocabulary is not essential for understanding of a reading if the subject matter is within the experience of the student. The cloze is sensitive to this experience factor. The cloze test is as effective in improving comprehension as a method using cloze reading without deletions.

11. Gregory-Panapoulos, J.F.

An Experimental Application of Cloze Procedure as a Diagnostic Test of Listening Comprehension Among Foreign Students.
Doctoral dissertation, University of Southern California, 1966.
Dissertation Abstracts, vol. 27 (1967), pp. 2213A, #67-404.

The purpose of this study was to explore the usefulness of the cloze as a diagnostic test of listening comprehension among foreign students of English. In particular, to estimate the reliability and validity of a cloze listening test in comparison with several other widely used tests of English language ability: Brown-Carlsen Listening Comprehension Test, California Reading Test. A "typical" 20 minute lecture on "study methods" was written and tape recorded. Several sections of tape were mutilated--every 5th word was deleted and random noise added. Blank leader tape was spliced in to give students time to write responses at various intervals. The cloze test seemed to measure listening comprehension among the 90 foreign students as validly yet more reliably than the Brown-Carlsen test. The cloze test seems to be more practical than the B-C. regarding ease of administration and scoring, as well as brevety.

12. Woltzman, Paul D.

English language proficiency testing and the individual.
pp. 76-84 in D.C. Wigglesworth (ed). Selected Conference Papers of the Association of Teachers of English as a Second Language.
Los Altos: Language Research Associates' Press, 1967.

The author indicates problems in ESL test research and interpretation, some of which are due to conflicts between the data analyst and the test interpreter who deals with individuals. The test factor "feed forward" or perceptual expectancy which deals with sets

of the categories that individuals have available for processing internal and/or external perceptions (e.g. language reception and production) needs to be explored and developed. The application of cloze procedure as a test using this "feed forward" factor is discussed.

13. Inal, Nevin.

Testing Knowledge of Prepositions by Using the Cloze Procedure. MA Thesis, UCLA 1972.

This study investigated the use of the cloze technique as a test of proficiency in English preposition usage. Cloze tests of prepostions appear to be valid and reliable. An item analysis showed a significant contrast between a group of speakers of one language background and a group of speakers from a variety of native language backgrounds. An analysis of cloze responses seems to be a useful diagnostic tool with application in teaching ESL.

14. Irvine, Patricia, Parvin Atai and John W. Oller Jr.

Cloze, Dictation and the Test of English as a Foreign Language. Language Learning, vol. 24, no. 2 (1974), pp. 245-252.

The TOEFL, a cloze test and two dictations were given to 159 ESL students in Tehran, Iran. Cloze tests marked for both exact and contextually acceptable responses correlated at (.94). Cloze tests correlated with the combined dictations scores at (.75). Cloze scored by either method correlated higher with the TOEFL total scores than did the dictations combined. The cloze and the dictations correlated best with the TOEFL Listening Comprehension section. The Listening Comprehension section appears to be the best section of the TOEFL because it is highly integrative.

15. Kirn, Harriet E.

The Effect of Practice on Performance on Dictations and Cloze Tests. MA Thesis, U.C.L.A. 1972.

Students given biweekly practice in dictation and cloze tasks over a period of nine weeks. The pre tests and post tests were comparable sets of dictations and cloze tests. After the post test the average

raw score improvement was calculated. It was found that there was no difference between the improvement rate of the experimental group and a control group of comparable background and size.

16. Klare, G.R., H.W. Sinaiko, and L.M. Stolurow.

The cloze procedure a convenient readability test for training materials and translations. International Review of Applied Psychology, vol. 21, no. 2 (1972), pp. 77-106.

A very general review of cloze procedure preceeds the main body of this paper. Two experiments are discussed: the first describes the use of cloze to select appropriate training manuals for use in adult basic education. The second involves the use of cloze in identifying readable translations of technical English into technical Vietnamese. A comprehensive cloze bibliography as of February 1971 is also included. This contains over 150 entries.

17. Mason, Victor.

Report on cloze tests administered to Thai students. Bulletin of the English Language Center, vol. 2, no. 1 (March 1972), pp. 31-39.

In this study 122 Thai high school students in their 12th year took a series of cloze tests: An English passage, a Thai passage, and translations of an English passage into Thai, and a Thai passage into English. The any-acceptable answer method was used in scoring. A control group of 35 American high school seniors took the English cloze tests. The results of the tests are compared and discussed. There appears to be a heavy burden placed on the Thai reader to find redundancy in Thai orthography. Thai syntax and morphology also contribute to the difficulty of using cloze tests in Thai. English cloze scores from two Thai schools used in the study showed considerable difference in the relationship between cloze scores and a government set English exam. One school's students had a high correlation, the other, a very low correlation.

18. Moss, Kenyon L.

Cloze testing in reading comprehension. TESL Reporter, vol. 6,

no. 1 (Fall 1972), pp. 3.

A brief description of an application of cloze testing to place ESL students in an individualized reading program.

19. Oller, John W. Jr.

Integrative and discrete-point tests at UCLA: A Reply. Workpapers in Teaching English as a Second Language, vol. 7 (1973), pp. 85-94.

This is a reply to an article by Earl Rand, "Integrative and discrete-point tests at UCLA" in Workpapers in TESL vol. 6 (1972), pp. 67-78. Oller examines Rand's criticisms and points out some of their weaknesses that derive from a confusion of definitions and identification of test types.

20. Oller, John W. Jr.

Cloze tests of second language proficiency and what they measure. Language Learning, vol. 23, no. 1 (1973), pp. 105-118.

This article is a survey of applications of the cloze procedure in ESL. It discusses methods of construction, scoring and administered and standardized. Inter-scorer reliability needs to be studied. Language skill cannot be separated from knowledge. Cloze tests measure a grammar of expectancy. In taking a cloze test, the subject analyzes the available information and synthesises a greater whole which then helps with further analysis and synthesis. Oller suggests that this is what happens in speaking and writing. Cloze tests of ESL proficiency correlate best with measures of listening comprehension.

21. Oller, John W. Jr.

Scoring methods and difficulty levels for cloze tests of proficiency in English as a second language. The Modern Language Journal, vol. 56, no. 3 (1972), pp. 151-158.

This is a study of cloze testing and various scoring methods. Subjects were foreign students at UCLA who took the English Second Language Placement Examination and a cloze test in the same sitting. Cloze tests were scored by five different methods: (1) exact word

replacement: (2) any acceptable word; (3) responses that only violated long-range constraints; (4) responses that only violated short-range constraints; (5) entirely wrong answers. The results indicate the any-acceptable-word fill-in method is superior in terms of item discrimination, and validating correlations regardless of the level of difficulty correlate best with tests that require a high level of integration of language skills.

22. Oller, John W. Jr., J. Donald Bowen; Ton That Dien and Victor W. Mason.

Cloze tests in English, Thai, and Vietnamese: Native and non-native performance. Language Learning, vol. 22, no. 1 (June 1972), pp. 1-15.

A passage in English was translated into Vietnamese and Thai, and a passage in Thai and one in Vietnamese were each translated into English. Speakers of English, Thai and Vietnamese were cloze tested in their own language. The Thais and Vietnamese, ESL students, were cloze tested on the English passage. Response types for native and non-native were compared. Native speakers in contrast to non-natives made almost no responses which failed to conform to at least some of the contextual constraints in the cloze test. Mean scores for native speakers on originals and translations revealed that carefully translating a passage from one language into another yields cloze tests of approximately equal difficulty. An item analysis is discussed. The context of items was much more important than any other single variable contributing to item difficulty.

23. Oller, John W. Jr. and Christine Conrad.

The cloze technique and ESL proficiency. Language Learning, vol. 21, no. 2 (December 1971), pp. 183-195.

The variety of fill-in test known as the cloze procedure is discussed as a device for teaching and testing ESL proficiency. Research with native and non-native speakers using cloze tests is briefly reviewed. An experiment is conducted to attempt to partially determine the discriminative power of the cloze test and

its validity as a device for measuring ESL proficiency. Performance on the UCLA English Language Pro iciency Examination by a group o' entering students at various ESL levels is compared to their cloze scores. The cloze test correlates best with the dictation (.82) and next best with the reading section (.80). It is concluded that the cloze method is a very promising device for measuring ESL proficiency.

24. Oller, John W. Jr. and Nevin Inal.

A cloze test of English prepositions, TESOL Quarterly, vol. 5, no. 4 (December 1971), pp. 315-326.

The cloze technique is explored as a basis for measuring the skill of ESL speakers in handling English prepositions. Three groups were tested using a cloze test with only prepositions removed. The groups consisted of 19 native speakers of English, 53 native speakers of Turkish, and 110 foreign students entering UCLA from a variety of language backgrounds. The data suggest that a cloze test of prepositions works best with students from a variety of backgrounds, though it is also useful for testing students from a homogeneous group. Student errors in the Turkish group could not be entirely predicted by contrastive analysis.

25. Owens, R.J.

Selecting a suitable 'reader'. R.E.L.C. Journal, vol. 2 (December 1971), pp. 29-34.

The author discusses the choice of a class reading text from various perspectives. He discusses student interest as being vital. Children read books as they eat ice-cream: because they like the taste and not because they think its nourishing. Text readability is discussed from the perspective of natural redundancy of language. A readability test based on systematic deletion of words from a passage is recommended to aid in selecting a text.

26. Pack, Alice C.

Cloze testing and procedure. T.E.S.L. Reporter, vol. 6, no. 2 (Winter 1973), pp. 1-2.

Pack explains the construction and scoring of a cloze test for ESL students. Placement on the basis of test scores is also discussed.

27. Rand, Earl J.

Integrative and discrete-point tests at U.C.L.A. Workpapers in Teaching English as a Second Language. vol. 6 (June 1972), pp. 67-68.

Rand challenges the view that integrative tests are more appropriate than discrete-point tests for ESL placement. Statistical evidence is given that supports this view and the consequences of relying solely on integrative tests are discussed.

28. Spolsky, Bernard.

Reduced redundancy as a language testing tool. pp. 383-390 in GE Perron and J.L.M. Trim (eds.), Applications of Linguistics. Cambridge: University Press, 1971.

This article assumes that before one can develop valid tests of language proficiency one must find out some way of characterizing the notion of knowing a language. Creativity is the basic distinction between language-like behavior and knowing a language. Control over the natural redundancy of a language is another indication of knowing a language. Three main techniques: cloze, clozentropy and the "noise" test have been developed that top control of redundancy and creativity. These techniques are discussed.

29. Spolsky, Bernard; Sigurd, B.; Sato, M.; Walker, E.; and Aterburn, C.

Preliminary studies in the development of techniques for testing overall second language proficiency. Language Learning, Special Issue No. 3 (August 1968), pp. 79-98.

The authors suggest that "knowing a language" involves a factor, overall proficiency in that language. They also suggest that this can be measured by testing a subject's ability to send and receive messages under varying conditions of distortion of the conducting medium. Subjects were asked to take down sentences in writing as they were presented orally. The presentation was distorted by

"white noise". The accuracy of the subjects' transcriptions is compared with other English proficiency tests and the results correlated favourably.

30. Stubbs, Joseph Bartow and G. Richard Tucker.

The cloze test as a measure of English proficiency. Modern Language Journal, vol. 58, no. 5-6 (September-October 1974), pp. 239-241.

A cloze test was administered as an integral part of the English Entrance Examination (E.E.E.) at the American University of Beirut. There were 211 subjects, mostly Arabic speakers. Cloze tests, marked by the exact-word-only replacement method, and the any-acceptable-answer method correlated very highly (.97) with each other. They also correlated highly with the E.E.E. totals at .71 and .76 respectively. The authors feel that other factors being equal, a cloze test scored for exact replacement could be used quite easily by a non-native teachers of English with confidence in the accuracy of the measure of proficiency.

31. Williams, Roger V.

Problems in cloze testing. TESL Reporter, vol. 7, no. 4 (Summer 1974), pp. 7-9.

Williams suggests that there are three problem areas related to cloze tests for ESL use: (1) cloze tests only partially parallel the reading process, (2) there seems to be a special talent required to be successful in writing cloze tests that has nothing to do with language, (3) a high number of crucial content words may be removed if an every n-th word deletion system is used, that is, words that cannot be predicted from the context. He proposes a solution for only the last problem area.